*Popular Music and Society*
*Vol. 29, No. 3, July 2006, pp. 335–357*

Routledge
Taylor & Francis Group

# The South-Grappelli Recordings of the Bach *Double Violin Concerto*

Benjamin Givan

*Among the earliest known jazz interpretations of Bach's music are two 1937 recordings of the Concerto for Two Violins in D minor featuring the American Eddie South and the Frenchman Stéphane Grappelli as soloists. Recorded in Paris with an accompaniment by guitarist Django Reinhardt, the discs represent not only an intersection of musical genres, but furthermore an encounter between performers of diverse nationalities and ethnicities.*

*A classically trained African American artist who turned to jazz out of economic necessity, South continued occasionally to perform classical works, often presenting them while adopting a consciously exoticized "gypsy" persona. Reinhardt's cultural trajectory was in some respects the reverse of South's: the guitarist was a Manouche gypsy who gravitated toward American jazz, only rarely acknowledging his own ethnic identity explicitly, though it was reflected in his musical language.*

*The Bach recordings were planned and overseen by the record producer and jazz critic Charles Delaunay, son of the post-cubist painter Robert Delaunay and raised among France's elite high-art community during the inter-war period. In this intellectual milieu, Bach's music was the focus of two distinct aesthetic ideologies (Taruskin "Back"), both of which, I argue, are manifested by the South-Grappelli recordings. At one level, the recordings present an artisanal Bach whose music can readily be assimilated into vernacular musical idioms like jazz or European gypsy music. But, at the same time, they reflect a conception of Bach's art as a transcendent, universal site where disparate other musical traditions could be engaged on neutral terms.*

J. S. Bach's music has, over the last century, probably received a greater range of non-traditional interpretations than that of any other classical composer. Beyond re-orchestrations like Leopold Stokowski's 1926 symphonic arrangement of the D-minor organ toccata, or Walter Carlos's 1968 Moog synthesizer album, *Switched on Bach*, Bach's works have also been re-imagined by exponents of innumerable vernacular and popular musical genres far outside the sphere of art music. One idiom that has seemed especially receptive to Bach is jazz: musicians such as Jacques Loussier, the Modern Jazz Quartet, Warne Marsh, Dave Brubeck, and Kenny Barron

ISSN 0300-7766 (print)/ISSN 1740-1712 (online) © 2006 Taylor & Francis
DOI: 10.1080/03007760600670406

have, at various times, used the composer's works as fodder for their own creative endeavors.[1]

Among the earliest jazz arrangements of Bach's music are two versions of the first movement from the D-minor Concerto for Two Violins (BWV 1043), recorded in Paris in 1937 by the violinists Eddie South and Stéphane Grappelli with guitar accompaniment by Django Reinhardt. The first version, dated 23 November and originally released on the *Swing* label (Swi 18, matrix no. OLA 1986-1), is entitled a "Swing Interpretation" of Bach's concerto—"Interprétation Swing du Première Mouvement du Concerto en Re Mineur de Jean-Sébastien Bach." The second, labeled an "Improvisation" on the same piece—"Improvisation sur le Première Mouvement du Concerto en Re Mineur de Jean-Sébastien Bach" (matrix no. OLA 1993-1)—was recorded two days later and released on the other side of the same 78 rpm disc.[2] The South-Grappelli recordings of Bach's "Double" Violin Concerto document not only a fusion of musical genres, but also a meeting between three performers of diverse nationalities and ethnicities: South was a black American, Grappelli a white Frenchman of partially Italian ancestry, and Reinhardt a Belgian-born Manouche gypsy. Their collaboration evinces a fluidly complex relationship between their social backgrounds and their music that is not easily reconcilable with some of the more inflexible ways race and culture have traditionally been theorized in critical discourse on jazz.

Central to such discourse is the basic question of how the music itself ought to be defined. Its usual definitions tend to vacillate between cultural and musical criteria, each delimiting its own domain while allowing for diversity in the other. Thus, when jazz is defined socioculturally, as the music of a specific ethnic community or social class, it may encompass a panoply of musical styles.[3] A definition based instead on its musical features, even if such features are culturally inscribed, will admit a diverse range of practitioners without necessarily acknowledging the variety of musics circulating within any given social group. (Combining both criteria risks being either inclusive beyond useful limits, or doubly restrictive.) Recent studies of musical and cultural hybridity have begun to rectify the exclusionary consequences of discrete, strictly defined categories and rigid binarisms, replacing them with more dynamic and flexible, if less exacting, interpretive systems.[4] Yet the older, more stable structures of thought still offer a secure framework for inquiry that gives them considerable tenacity, and current discourse remains, on the whole, far less rich than the cultural terrain it scrutinizes. This deficiency may be especially apparent in jazz scholarship, where historical questions of the music's social function, aesthetic character, and rank within the cultural hierarchy have always been dominated by the issue of race. The 1937 jazz interpretations of the Bach Double Concerto brought together three musicians who, though long since recognized as significant figures in the jazz canon, have nonetheless tended to be marginalized by narratives positioning the music as a signifier of African American ethnicity or, more generally, American democratic pluralism (see Atkins). Their recordings document an interweaving of disparate musical and cultural strands which corroborates today's emerging scholarly

consensus that racially reductive views of jazz's past have excluded a great deal of inherent complexity that resists generalization, and that furthermore the self-conscious eclecticism of much contemporary jazz is not so new as it might seem.[5]

Stéphane Grappelli (1908–97) and Django Reinhardt (1910–53) were the most famous and influential non-American jazz musicians active before World War II. Grappelli, a self-taught violinist born in Montmartre, began his career playing for silent films and jazz orchestras during the 1920s and first met Reinhardt at the Croix du Sud nightclub in Montparnasse in late 1931. The guitarist, an entirely unschooled gypsy who lived most of his life in a caravan, was staying with the artist Emile Savitry at the time, and rapidly acquiring a reputation as one of Paris's leading musicians (Delaunay, *Django* 58–59). In December 1934 the two men, joined by a pair of rhythm guitarists and a bassist, debuted as leaders of the Quintet of the Hot Club of France, an ensemble that remained intermittently active (with various personnel changes) for over a decade. They had been performing and recording with the Quintet for almost three years by the time they crossed paths with Eddie South in late 1937.

Although South (1904–62), an African American born in Louisiana, Missouri, and raised in Chicago, was culturally far more typical of Swing-era jazz musicians than were Grappelli and Reinhardt, in some respects his musical background was just as far from the norm. Classically trained from the age of 10, he began playing jazz in his late teens as a sideman with Freddie Keppard and in orchestras led by Jimmy Wade and Erskine Tate. In 1928 he traveled to Europe, leading his own group, the "Alabamians," and studying at the Paris Conservatory and in Budapest (Glaser and Barnett 636–37).[6] While in Paris, according to one source, he may have heard gypsy violinists for the first time, and in March of 1929 he and the Alabamians recorded "Two Guitars," a multisectional minor-key piece that signaled his growing predilection for gypsy-inspired material.[7] Several years after returning to Chicago in 1931, South toured Europe again, visiting Paris between late 1937 and February 1938 while the city hosted an International Exposition.

South's jazz playing featured a pure tone, steady vibrato, and legato bowing technique that reflected his formal training and set him apart from an autodidact like Grappelli. The two violinists' contrasting styles are juxtaposed on the four jazz sides they recorded together in addition to the Bach discs—"Lady Be Good," "Dinah," "Daphne," and "Fiddle Blues" (South and Reinhardt collaborated on four other records without Grappelli). "Eddie was a magnificent musician. He was very academic, he had amazing dexterity, and his intonation was excellent," recalled the bassist Milt Hinton, who played with South in Chicago during the early 1930s. "He might play a difficult classical passage on one chorus and then swing harder than anyone on the next three" (Hinton and Berger 57). Like many early jazz musicians, South frequently played material that is no longer identified with the standard jazz repertoire, often favoring light-classical melodies and encore pieces that allowed him to display his classically-based technique and interpretative skills.[8] On the limited evidence of recordings, his forays into the classical repertory were mainly restricted to vignettes along the lines of Fritz Kreisler's "Praeludium and Allegro," and Paganini's

"Caprice No. 24"; Hinton also mentions live renditions of George Gershwin's *American in Paris* and *Rhapsody in Blue* (Hinton and Berger 45).[9] South rarely, if ever, publicly performed concert literature by more canonic composers like Bach, so the Double Concerto recordings of 1937 still represented a significant departure for him.

There were few African American instrumentalists playing classical music professionally during the first half of the 20th century (African American classical singers were less uncommon), and by the early 1930s South had underscored his novel status by assuming an exoticized public persona, "The Black Gypsy." In keeping with the longstanding Western conflation of "Hungarian" and "Gypsy" cultural forms, he adopted a Hungarian theme song, Jenö Hubay's "Hejre Kati," and even, according to Hinton, sang publicly in Hungarian.[10] He also published, in 1934, a self-titled composition, "Black Gypsy," for violin with piano accompaniment, which he recorded in the Netherlands shortly after leaving France in early 1938.[11] The piece contains a combination of light-classical stylistic references, blues gestures, jazzlike added-sixth harmonies, stereotypical gypsy signifiers such as rapid open-string double-stopped detaché passages, and more generic exotic mannerisms such as parallel fifths and fourths.

In its melding of two figures of alterity, a pre-existing African American identity with a contrived gypsy one, South's "Black Gypsy" persona exemplifies the performance mode George Lipsitz calls "strategic anti-essentialism," or "the appearance of celebrating the fluidity of identities, but…[actually] seeking a…disguise…[in order to] highlight…an aspect of one's identity that one can not express directly" (Lipsitz 62)—in short, to assert "important aspects of who…[one] is by playing at being something…[one] is not" (ibid. 71). From an American standpoint, the figure of the gypsy as Other is bivalent—it is simultaneously European and exotic, symbolizing a marginalized subgroup of a globally dominant cultural identity. Although in South's case this duality inclined toward the Europeanist gaze through which the orientalized gypsy was constructed, it nonetheless enabled him to contravene prevalent monolithic conceptions of African American identity without unequivocally embracing aspects of white culture. At the same time, by masking reality, South's "Black Gypsy" persona may also have diminished his transgressive impact as an African American instrumentalist performing in a prestigious cultivated style.

In Reinhardt, South encountered a genuine European gypsy who had moved even further beyond his own culture's characteristic musical idiom than the violinist had. Reinhardt began his career playing the banjo-guitar in the two- or three-piece accordion-led *musette* ensembles that were often heard performing popular waltzes and dance numbers in Parisian *bals-musettes* (working-class dance halls). During the late 1920s, while recovering from a permanently disabling injury to two of his left fingers, he took up the guitar and dedicated himself to the musical language and repertoire of jazz. With American culture suffusing inter-war French life, Reinhardt became enamored of all manner of transatlantic cultural imports, from music and

movies to automobiles, thereby following trends from the mainstream society on whose fringes gypsies were ordinarily situated. To an extent, Reinhardt and South had followed symmetrical cultural trajectories, each assimilating the other's musical heritage.[12]

They recorded their first rendition of the Bach Double Concerto, the "Swing Interpretation" of 23 November, at Pathé Studios, at 69 Avenue de la Grande Armée 17e. The recording session's producer was the critic and discographer Charles Delaunay (1911–88), who had recently founded the Swing record label. Delaunay, who enjoyed listening to Baroque music while writing, loaned the musically illiterate Reinhardt a copy of Yehudi Menuhin and George Enescu's 1932 recording of the concerto and brought the sheet music to the studio, proposing that South and Grappelli try improvising on it (Smith 83; Dregni 137). The violinists' reaction was "very reserved, as if they were afraid of committing a crime of high treason," Delaunay later recalled (*Delaunay's Dilemma* 232–33, quoted in Dregni 137). "I put the music up on the music stand. They looked at it and said 'It's difficult!' …I told them, 'You do the introduction and then you improvise without the sheet music'" (quoted in Smith 84). Delaunay's suggested four-bar introduction, which Grappelli plays unaccompanied, quotes the opening trumpet fanfare from Louis Armstrong's 1929 recording of "Mahogany Hall Stomp," and it leads directly into the first movement of Bach's concerto, with South, taking the second violin part, playing the first fugal entry. "I asked the two violinists to play improvisations simultaneously as freely as possible yet remaining faithful to the original music," Delaunay remembered. "For the first take, at the moment where the two soloists should have abandoned the sheet music, South and Grappelli continued to read and play from the music despite all my gesticulations" (quoted in Dregni 137). The violinists adhere closely to the score throughout the recording, adding only a little improvised figuration, and Reinhardt's "oompah" guitar accompaniment mainly follows Bach's harmonic framework. All three musicians reinterpret the written eighth notes as quarter notes and the sixteenth notes as "swung" eighth notes, so that each of Bach's measures sounds like two jazz measures.

At m. 22 of the movement, Grappelli, playing the first violin part, begins the piece's first solo episode, but when South follows with his imitative entry at m. 26, Grappelli drops out, omitting Bach's written countersubject. As South concludes the imitative entry (m. 29), the violinists deviate from the score by returning directly to m. 1, this time exchanging roles so that Grappelli begins with the second violin part and South follows playing the first. The reason for this revision, which omits over half the movement, is unclear. It may have been designed to keep the performance's total duration within the capacity of one side of a ten-inch 78 rpm disc. But another consideration could have been its excision of the work's most technically demanding passages, since, according to Delaunay, the violinists had had no opportunity to practice or rehearse their parts in advance. The performers begin playing through the movement a second time, but at the first solo episode South plays the countersubject that Grappelli previously omitted. When they reach m. 29, the point where they

initially returned to m. 1, they conclude the recording by skipping abruptly to m. 85 and playing the movement's final four bars.

Disappointed that the violinists had followed Bach's score quite closely rather than improvising freely, Delaunay asked the three musicians to re-record the piece when they returned to the studio two days later. "I said, 'We'll do it again. I'm sure you know the number,'" he recalled. "So they started, and immediately after the first chorus—if I may call that a chorus—I took the music away!"(Smith 83). In this second version, transcribed in Example 1, the violinists again follow the score closely up until the first solo episode (m. 24), which is presumably when Delaunay removed the sheet music. The rest of the recording consists of improvised exchanges between the violins; there is no apparent predetermined harmonic structure, but Reinhardt mainly alternates between four-bar sections based either on the movement's opening chord progression or on the first solo episode with its distinctive cycle-of-fifths sequence.

The long history of jazz artists self-consciously drawing on elements of classical music begins at least as early as 1924, when the Paul Whiteman Orchestra premiered Gershwin's *Rhapsody in Blue*, and by the late 1930s several leading jazz musicians were exploring the classical repertoire—Benny Goodman's extensive involvement with art music and the John Kirby band's jazz arrangements of various classical works are some familiar instances. Reinhardt, too, recorded versions of popular classical pieces by composers like Liszt, Grieg, Tchaikovsky, and Kreisler over the course of his career, and even wrote a *Bolero* that was performed in a concert alongside Ravel's.[13] Yet the Bach concerto recordings initially met with a decidedly mixed reception. They were reviewed favorably in 1938 by the French critic Hughes Panassié, who was hardly disinterested, having both co-founded the Swing label with Delaunay and participated personally in the Bach recording sessions.[14] Praising the "Swing Interpretation" for having "succeeded in allying all the joyous forces of Bach's music to the spontaneities typical of hot jazz" so as to realize latent "affinities between Bach and jazz," Pannasié especially commended the guitarist's contribution, writing that "[Reinhardt] has created, from [a] little scrap, the accompaniment from a rhythmical point of view, and although obliged to simplify the harmonies for a single guitar, he was able to furnish the essential base [figured bass] with astonishing precision and sureness" (120). Others greeted the recordings with considerably less enthusiasm, however. According to Grappelli's biographer, Geoffrey Smith, BBC radio banned the disc during World War II (Smith 84). And the German critic Joachim E. Berendt (1922–2000) even claimed that, while France was under Nazi occupation during the same period, "the German occupation authorities in Paris melted down all available copies of [the] record as [an]…example of 'degenerate art' (*Entartete Kunst*)" (Berendt 360), presumably aggrieved at its perceived desecration of a German masterwork. Clearly the disc had engaged an array of aesthetic, racial, and nationalistic issues and was seen in political terms almost from the moment it was released.

Besides Delaunay, Grappelli is the only participant whose impressions of the Bach recordings are well documented. Some decades later, the violinist's attitude was

**Example 1** South, Grappelli, and Reinhardt, "Improvisation sur le Première Mouvement du Concerto en Re Mineur de Jean-Sébastien Bach."

**Example 1** Continued.

**Example 1** Continued.

**Example 1** Continued.

**Example 1** Continued.

**Example 1** Continued.

**Example 1** Continued.

**Example 1** Continued.

**Example 1** Continued.

**Example 1** Continued.

**Example 1** Continued.

somewhat equivocal, but on the whole he took a dim view of the project, claiming to have been against it from the outset, and averring that:

> in my opinion we should leave Bach alone and play some jazz tune instead. But apparently some masochists like it—so there you are….I think it's a danger to jazz some classical music—it's a mistake. It's like when I hear on the radio the fifth symphony of Beethoven in disco—well, they should be in jail, those guys….I mean it. It's disgusting. I think we have enough jazz tunes…to leave classical music alone. (quoted in Glaser with Grappelli 23–24)[15]

Grappelli, who had been amply exposed to classical music since his youth but was without formal training or experience as a classical performer, evidently considered the genre sacrosanct and preferably uncorrupted by foreign intrusions. Distinguishing between its stylistic hermeticism and jazz's freer openness to classical techniques among sundry other external influences, he reflected that "when you play jazz, of course you have some reminiscence, like Art Tatum, Debussy and Ravel, and modern—Bartók sometimes. Because in jazz music you've got all sorts of music—all the music is in jazz—rhythm, swing, melody, ad libitum—everything—ballad—there is everything" (quoted in Glaser with Grappelli 24). But, as for the Bach concerto recordings, Grappelli disavowed all responsibility, insisting that "it was Mr. Charles Delaunay's idea" (quoted in ibid. 23).[16]

Delaunay himself may conceivably have had concrete ideological motivations. A politically conscious individual who became involved in the French Resistance during World War II, in the 1930s he helped lead efforts to promote native French jazz through institutions such as magazines, concerts, and societies like the Hot Club of France (Jackson 193). When jazz had first arrived in Europe after World War I, the historian Jeffrey H. Jackson contends, it had appeared so "unquestionably foreign" that the very notion of "French jazz players" seemed oxymoronic. And even a decade or more later, it was still commonly thought that, as one contemporary American observer put it, "European orchestras cannot play good dance music—that is, the jazzy peppy kind."[17] But by 1933 views had changed to the extent that Léon Fiot, editor of the magazine *Jazz-Tango-Dancing*, voiced a widely felt sentiment when he wrote of his desire "to form an orchestra of hot jazz composed only of the best French musicians" (Jackson 133, 164). His ambition was realized the next year with the founding of the Quintet of the Hot Club of France, an ensemble now generally considered "the most important musical contribution in France's nationalization of jazz" (Kenney, "*Le Hot*" 18–19).[18] In this context, Delaunay's Bach concerto recordings of 1937 not only served to bolster jazz's cultural legitimacy by affiliating it with the more prestigious classical idiom, as Panassié's review noted, but also demonstrated that French musicians, far from being hampered by European training, had mastered jazz so thoroughly that they confronted classical music from an entirely external standpoint. Indeed, both Reinhardt and Grappelli were far less conversant with European classical music than was their American colleague, South.

Delaunay's personal history suggests that the Bach recordings may also reflect trends in European musical aesthetics of the era. The son of the post-cubist visual artists Robert and Sonia Delaunay, he was raised among the elite Parisian cultural establishment and exposed from an early age to many of the inter-war art world's ideas and debates. "When I was growing up," he later reminisced:

> I must have seen fifty per cent of all the well-known people in Paris passing in and out of our apartment—Apollinaire and Kandinsky and Stravinsky and Diaghilev and Klee and Mondrian and Breton and Aragon. Of course, in Paris before the war everybody used to meet in the cafés and in their homes. They discussed art. They discussed music. They discussed books. They discussed each other. They discussed all night. Paris was filled with talking before the war. (quoted in Balliett 8)

And when Delaunay was 10 years old, in the spring of 1921, his father Robert (whose modest record collection included just three jazz discs) even painted Igor Stravinsky's portrait, a year after the composer's ballet *Pulcinella* premiered at the Paris Opera (Walsh 329). The ballet's now well-known score, consisting of free arrangements of music by Giambattista Pergolesi and other, mainly Italian, Baroque composers, was Stravinsky's attempt to refashion 18th-century music in service of a modernist compositional idiom.[19] In its reworking of Baroque musical practices, *Pulcinella* embodied the stylistic principles of neoclassicism, a contemporary artistic movement that represents an important historical backdrop to Charles Delaunay's endeavor to draw together the worlds of Bach and of jazz.

Among the exponents of neoclassicism during the 1920s, Richard Taruskin has noted, Bach's music was associated with two principal ideologies. The first, advanced mainly by French composers and manifested above all in the works of Stravinsky (a Russian exile then based in France), centered on the idea of "purity," involved "the renunciation of all national character in favor of a musical Esperanto," and upheld Bach as a "perceived fountainhead of 'universal' musical values" (Taruskin, "Back" 293). The second Bachian ideology, influencing the music of progressive German composers like Paul Hindemith, was tied to the contemporary notion of *Gebrauchsmusik* ("use-music"), which cast music as an ordinary social activity rather than an elite art. From the French point of view, Bach's music possessed a formal perfection transcending the contingencies of its historical and national origins, while from the German perspective the same music epitomized skillful craftsmanship above all. Delaunay, by virtue of his upbringing, was surely at least cursorily familiar with such aesthetic arguments—in 1924 his father had written a polemic decrying neoclassicism as reactionary—and he contrived a union of jazz and Baroque music that resonates with both prevalent conceptions of Bach (Delaunay, "Constructionism" 4).[20]

By refracting Bach's concerto through the vernacular prisms of jazz and gypsy music, South, Grappelli, and Reinhardt divested it of its customary trappings of high-art prestige, and by transforming the work through improvisation, especially in the second of their two recordings, they flouted any notion of the printed score's textual sanctity. In these respects, their interpretation echoes the anti-elitism of German neoclassicism by relocating Baroque music beyond the frame of bourgeois European convention. At the same time, its anti-elitist impulse harkens back to the music's 18th-century origins, when Bach's works were considered functional media of entertainment or religious worship rather than timeless artistic masterpieces. A three-piece ensemble is, notably, far closer to the "Concerto for 6" designated by the composer's autograph score than are the typically larger orchestral forces of most 20th-century interpretations. And, like the Baroque continuo of Leipzig's (partially amateur) "Bachische" Collegium Musicum during the 1720s and '30s, Reinhardt's guitar accompaniment is more fully improvised than the solo parts, a reversal of jazz's typical focus on the solo improviser.[21]

But Reinhardt's extemporized chordal background also effaces much of the original score's complexity, supplanting the written contrapuntal ensemble lines that interact with the solo violinists. In its subservience to the soloists, his is more of a true "accompaniment" than Bach's more equitable distribution of the polyphonic texture between the soloists and the orchestra. (Reinhardt seems to have been predisposed toward harmony rather than counterpoint, a bias that probably influenced his non-contrapuntal conception of Bach's music—Delaunay recalled the guitarist saying, "the harmonies, that's what I like best of all in music … That's why I like J. S. Bach so much, all his music is built up on the bass" (quoted in Delaunay, *Django* 26)). When South and Grappelli dispense with the written score in their second recording of the piece, furthermore, the performance metamorphoses into a more or less conventional

jazz format—improvised solos with accompaniment—whose only remaining resemblance to Bach's concerto lies in its basic harmonic progressions. This reduction of contrapuntal detail accords with the strain of French musical neoclassicism inspired by Jean Cocteau, who, in the wake of World War I, famously advocated an art of the "every-day," liberated from the hegemony of Wagnerian Teutonic complexity. For the French neoclassicist composers who sought to pursue Cocteau's ideals of structural simplicity, chief among them the disciples of Erik Satie known as "Les Six," popular entertainment, and jazz in particular, was an especially powerful source of influence.[22] Yet even the works in which this influence was most salient, like Darius Milhaud's *La Création du Monde* (1923) with its "jazz fugue," remained securely rooted in the art-music world. By re-envisioning the same stylistic synthesis, South, Grappelli, and Reinhardt brought about an even more radical transformation of art music, jettisoning its contrapuntal foundation and finally all but obliterating it through jazz's contemporary, popular, vernacular expressive force.

Given Bach's universalized status in French artistic circles, his concerto, as the improvisers' point of departure, would have seemed to offer the nearest thing to a neutral arena for integrating jazz and gypsy music with high art. Consequently, just as inter-war critics saw Stravinsky's neoclassicism as a "synthesis of many different elements, such as Bach…and the rhythmic frenzy of negro-american music" (De Schloezer 97–141, quoted in Messing 132) whose fundamental aesthetic impulse was "objectivity," Delaunay's "Improvisation sur le Première Mouvement du Concerto en Re Mineur de Jean-Sébastien Bach" served as an objective point of engagement between separate musical traditions—a means of enhancing jazz's prestige and, conversely, vernacularizing high art. The recordings of November 1937, made as the specter of totalitarianism loomed over the continent, thus symbolized a moral argument for art's capacity to surmount geographic, racial, ethnic, and musical differences. The fortuitous circumstances of their creation were fleeting. By 1939, with South permanently back in the United States, Grappelli found himself stranded in England for the duration of World War II while Reinhardt led a sometimes fugitive existence in Nazi-occupied Europe. The violinist later remembered his American guest as "a nice person, a gentleman, and a divine musician….We played, he left Paris and I never saw him again" (quoted in Glaser with Grappelli 23).

## Acknowledgements

An earlier version of this paper was presented at the 2003 annual meeting of the Society for Ethnomusicology in Miami, Florida. I would like to thank Charles M. Joseph for his helpful comments.

## Notes

[1] Jacques Loussier, *Play Bach*, Vols. 1 & 2 (Decca 157561 & 157562); The Modern Jazz Quartet, *Blues on Bach* (Atlantic 1652-2); Warne Marsh, "Bach 2 Part Invention No. 13," *Ne Plus Ultra* (Hat Hut); Peter, Paul, and Mary with Dave Brubeck, "Because All Men Are Brothers,"

*Carry It On* (Warner Bros.); Kenny Barron with Stefon Harris, Ron Carter, and Lewis Nash, *The Classical Jazz Quartet Plays Bach* (Vertical Jazz). See Hunkemöller.

[2] The recordings have been reissued on various CD compilations. Currently available versions include *Django with His American Friends* (DRG 8493), *Eddie South 1923–37* (Classics 707), and *Eddie South 1937–41* (Classics 737).

[3] William Howland Kenney has proposed a definition of jazz based on the "specific social, economic, and racial experiences among those who performed it and those who eagerly listened to it" ("Historical" 112).

[4] On the exclusionary effects of rigid racial and musical categories, see Waterman, also Tomlinson. For a historical analysis of how the concept of black music emerged as an American racial ideology, see Radano.

[5] For a critique of traditional jazz historiography's over-reliance on black/white racial binarisms, see Ake.

[6] South was not the first African American violinist to study in Europe—Will Marion Cook studied with Josef Joachim in Berlin during the 1880s. See Southern (268).

[7] A meeting in Paris between South and Russian gypsy violin players is related in Crowther (12).

[8] Another prominent jazz musician active during the 1920s whose repertoire extended beyond today's prevalent definitions of jazz was the composer and bandleader Fletcher Henderson. See Magee (27–38).

[9] South recorded "Rhapsody in Blue" in the 1940s.

[10] Milt Hinton, "Jazzspeak #2," recorded reminiscence on the CD *Old Man Time* (Chiaroscuro, CR(D) 310). On the equation of "Hungarian" and "Gypsy" music by 19th-century nationalist composers like Franz Liszt, see Malvinni (8–12 and passim).

[11] South's sheet music for "Black Gypsy" is reproduced in Barnett (107–08).

[12] South's adoption of a Gypsy persona was echoed several decades later by another African American musician, Jimi Hendrix (discussed in Gopnik (108)).

[13] The records are: "Liebestraum No. 3," by Franz Liszt (26 April 1937; matrix OLA 1714–1); "Danse Norvégienne," by Edvard Grieg (six different recordings, the earliest dated 13 December 1940; matrix OSW 148–1); "Improvisation on Tchaikowsky's Starry Night," based on the final movement of Pyotr Ilyich Tchaikovsky's *Symphony No. 6* (January–February 1949; matrix CW 57); and "Liebesfreud," by Fritz Kreisler (13 December 1930; matrix OSW 150–1). Reinhardt's own composition, "Bolero," was recorded on 14 December 1937 (matrices X2LA 1996–1 (master take) and X2LA 1996–2 (alternate take)). Its public performance is noted in Delaunay (*Django* 25).

[14] Contradicting Delaunay's account, Grappelli remembered that it was Panassié, not Delaunay, who insisted that the musicians re-record the concerto and then compelled them to improvise by removing the sheet music during the session. See Balmer (108).

[15] Contrary to this quotation, Smith refers to an uncited 1975 interview in which Grappelli claims to have been "very pleased when somebody had the idea" to record Bach's concerto (84).

[16] Interestingly, Grappelli's manager and companion Joseph Oldenhove claimed that at the time of the violinist's death in 1997, "he wanted to record the Bach Double Concerto as a sort of last testament. He would play on his own, all four parts. I copied the parts for him but sadly he never had time to complete this ambition. This was his way of making amends for the 1937 Double Concerto with Eddie South, which he was never happy with" (quoted in Balmer 365–66).

[17] *Afro-American* 26 Aug. 1933, quoted in Jackson 126.

[18] Kenney briefly discusses the Bach Double Concerto recordings (22–23).

[19] Richard Taruskin argues that *Pulcinella* manifests imaginary Russian ("Turanian") aesthetic principles of *drobnost'* (a sum-of-parts), *nepodvizhnost'* (immobility), and *uproshcheniye* (simplification of means) (*Stravinsky* 1449–56).

[20] If, as I suggest here, Charles Delaunay did not share his father's philosophical aversion to neoclassicism, it would not be the only artistic matter upon which the two disagreed. Robert Delaunay also argued for the primacy of visual aesthetic experience, declaring "I am horrified by *music and noise*" ("Letter," quoted in Kahn 53).

[21] Christoph Wolff dates the Double Violin Concerto to around 1730 (''Introduction'' 4). For more on the Leipzig Collegium Musicum, see Wolff (*Johann Sebastian Bach* 351–72).

[22] For a brief summary of Cocteau's program, see Morgan (159). For a more extensive discussion, see Messing (77–85).

## Works Cited


Ake, David. '''Blue Horizon': Creole Culture in Early New Orleans Jazz.'' *Jazz Cultures*. Berkeley, CA: U of California P, 2002. 10–41.

Atkins, E. Taylor. ''Toward a Global History of Jazz.'' *Jazz Planet*. Ed. E. Taylor Atkins. Jackson, MS: UP of Mississippi, 2003. xi–xxvii.

Balliett, Whitney. *American Musicians II: Seventy-Two Portraits in Jazz*. New York: Oxford UP, 1996.

Balmer, Paul. *Stéphane Grappelli: With and Without Django*. London: Sanctuary, 2003.

Barnett, Anthony. *Black Gypsy: The Recordings of Eddie South: An Annotated Discography and Itinerary*. Lewes: Allardyce, 1999.

Berendt, Joachim E. *The Jazz Book: From Ragtime to Fusion and Beyond*. Rev. Günther Huesmann. Trans. H. Bredigkeit and B. Bredigkeit with Dan Morgenstern and Tim Nevill. Brooklyn, NY: Lawrence Hill Books, 1992.

Crowther, Bruce. ''The Forgotten Ones: Eddie South,'' *Jazz Journal International* 36.8 (Aug. 1983): 12–13.

Delaunay, Charles. *Delaunay's Dilemma: De la peinture au jazz*. Mâcon: Editions W, 1985.

———. *Django Reinhardt*. Trans. Michael James. New York: Da Capo Press, 1981.

Delaunay, Robert. ''Constructionism and Neoclassicism.'' *The New Art of Color: The Writings of Robert and Sonia Delaunay*. Ed. Arthur A. Cohen. Trans. David Shapiro and Arthur Cohen. New York: Viking, 1978. 4–15.

———. ''Letter to Franz Marc.'' *The New Art of Color: The Writings of Robert and Sonia Delaunay*. Ed. Arthur A. Cohen. Trans. David Shapiro and Arthur Cohen. New York: Viking, 1978. 115–17.

de Schloezer, Boris. ''Igor Stravinsky.'' *La Revue Musicale* 1 Dec. 1923: 97–141.

Dregni, Michael. *Django: The Life and Music of a Gypsy Legend*. New York: Oxford UP, 2004.

Glaser, Matt and Anthony Barnett. ''Eddie South.'' *The New Grove Dictionary of Jazz*. Vol. 3, 2nd edn. Barry Kernfeld. London: Macmillan, 2002. 636–37.

Glaser, Matt and Stéphane Grappelli. *Jazz Violin*. New York: Oak Publications, 1981.

Gopnik, Adam. ''Gypsy.'' *The New Yorker* 6 Dec. 2004: 102–108.

Hinton, Milt and David G. Berger. *Bass Line: The Stories and Photographs of Milt Hinton*. Philadelphia, PA: Temple UP, 1988.

Hunkemöller, Jürgen. ''Roots and Wings: Jazz-Dialoge Mit Bach im Jahr 2000.'' *Jazzforschung* 36 (2004): 13–27.

Jackson, Jeffrey H. *Making Jazz French: Music and Modern Life in Interwar Paris*. Durham, NC: Duke UP, 2003.

Kahn, Douglas. *Noise, Water, Meat: A History of Sound in the Arts*. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 1999.

Kenney, William Howland. ''Historical Context and the Definition of Jazz: Putting More of the History in 'Jazz History.''' *Jazz among the Discourses*. Ed. Krin Gabbard. Durham, NC: Duke UP, 1995. 100–16.

———. ''*Le Hot*: The Assimilation of American Jazz in France, 1917–1940.'' *American Studies* 25 (1984): 5–24.

Lipsitz, George. *Dangerous Crossroads: Popular Music, Postmodernism, and the Poetics of Place*. London: Verso, 1994.

Magee, Jeffrey. *The Uncrowned King of Swing: Fletcher Henderson and Big Band Jazz*. New York: Oxford UP, 2004.

Malvinni, David. *The Gypsy Caravan: From Real Roma to Imaginary Gypsies in Western Music and Film*. New York: Routledge, 2004.

Messing, Scott. *Neoclassicism in Music: From the Genesis of the Concept through the Schoenberg/Stravinsky Polemic*. Ann Arbor, MI: UMI Research Press, 1988.

Morgan, Robert P. *Twentieth-Century Music: A History of Musical Style in Modern Europe and America*. New York: Norton, 1991.

Panassié, Hughes. "Review of Eddie South, Stéphane Grappelli and Django Reinhardt, 'Swing Interpretation of the First Movement'/'Improvisation "Concerto in D Minor" by J. S. Bach Swing 18.'" Trans. Walter E. Schaap. *Jazz Hot* Apr.–May 1938. Rpt in Paul Vernon, *Jean "Django" Reinhardt: A Contextual Bio-Discography 1910–1953*. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2003. 120.

Radano, Ronald. *Lying up a Nation: Race and Black Music*. Chicago, IL: U of Chicago P, 2003.

Smith, Geoffrey. *Stéphane Grappelli*. London: Pavilion, 1987.

Southern, Eileen. *The Music of Black Americans: A History*. 2nd edn. New York: Norton, 1983.

Taruskin, Richard. "Back to Whom? Neoclassicism as Ideology." *Nineteenth-Century Music* 16.3 (1993): 286–302.

———. *Stravinsky and the Russian Traditions: A Biography of the Works through Mavra*. Berkeley, CA: U of California P, 1996.

Tomlinson, Gary. "Cultural Dialogics and Jazz: A White Historian Signifies." *Disciplining Music: Musicology and Its Canons*. Ed. Katherine Bergeron and Philip V. Bohlman. Chicago, IL: U of Chicago P, 1992. 64–94.

Walsh, Stephen. *Stravinsky: A Creative Spring: Russia and France 1882–1934*. New York: Knopf, 1999.

Waterman, Christopher A. "Race Music: Bo Chatmon, 'Corrina Corrina,' and the Excluded Middle." *Music and the Racial Imagination*. Ed. Ronald Radano and Philip V. Bohlman. Chicago, IL: U of Chicago P, 2000. 167–205.

Wolff, Christoph. "Introduction" to J. S. Bach, *Concerto in D Minor for Two Violins, Strings and Continuo BWV 1043: Facsimile Edition of the Original Performing Parts with an Introduction by Christoph Wolff*. New York: C. F. Peters, 1990.

———. *Johann Sebastian Bach: The Learned Musician*. New York: Norton, 2000.